NATURALISTIC DECISION-MAKING IN LAW ENFORCEMENT PRACTICE – EXPLORING THE PROCESS

by

Michael T. Uttaro

Dissertation submitted to the Faculty of Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

Adult Learning and Human Resource Development

Marcie Boucouvalas, Chair
Marvin Cline
Peter Hamilton
Linda Morris
Albert Wiswell

March 26, 2002

Falls Church, Virginia

Keywords: Law Enforcement, Police, Decision-Making
NATURALISTIC DECISION-MAKING IN LAW ENFORCEMENT PRACTICE – EXPLORING THE PROCESS

Michael T. Uttaro

(ABSTRACT)

This research explored the process by which several experienced and successful law enforcement officials arrive at the most effective method of decision-making. It draws from traditional decision theory models, but uses the naturalistic decision-making (NDM) paradigm as its guide.

Studies framed by the NDM model have included fighter and commercial pilots, health care professionals, battle commanders, and others. Missing, however, are studies of law-enforcement officers making judgments and decisions under operational conditions. This examination utilized qualitative case study methods of participant observation and focused interviews to collect data and followed Lincoln and Guba's case study structure by identifying the problem, the context, the issues, and the lessons learned. Coding and analysis of the data conformed to the model initially outlined by Strauss (1987) and later redefined by Corbin
and Strauss (1990), including open coding, axial coding, and selective coding.

The findings on the decision-making/judgments processes of three experienced law enforcement officials revealed that each officer strived to control the impending event utilizing a number of rational and intuitive processes. One practice was scanning for detail embedded in the situation and utilizing this information for subsequent development of a cognitive map. Additionally, all the officers pursued a comprehensive preparation phase that consisted of the creation of worst-case scenarios and planning tactics to effectively respond to these cases. When decision-making was required, the information available through the scanning process and the preparation phases acted as the foundation for the development of the cognitive map that led each officer to successful resolution of their respective cases.

This study concluded with areas requiring further research and made recommendation that seek to improve police training practices.
Dedicated to my father, A. Raymond Uttaro, whom

I love and miss deeply.
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank several people for their help, support and contribution towards the completion of this dissertation. First and foremost, I thank God for giving me the opportunity to reach this level of study.

To my wife Maureen and children Michael, Mark, and Lisa, I can never return the lost time taken away from you as a result of this work. Without your support, encouragement, understanding and unconditional love, this study would not have happened.

To my brothers and sisters in the law enforcement community and for the many who have lost their lives in the line of duty, I hope this project make a contribution towards the betterment of our profession.

To my committee members, special thanks for your wisdom and scholarly advice that guided this research to fruition. A special thank you to Dr. Marcie Boucouvalas, chair of my committee, whose support, insight, and wisdom provided the necessary guidance to complete this initiative. To Dr. Jerry Cline, a very special man whom I respect and admire like no other, thank you for being there.

Finally, I would like to thank the law enforcement officials who agreed to participate in this study. Your recognition and professionalism in law enforcement is unsurpassed and your contributions to the betterment of society make a difference.
# Table of Contents

Abstract

Dedication

Acknowledgements

Table of Contents

List of Tables

List of Figures

## Chapter 1: Introduction

Opening
Background of the Problem
The Problem
Purpose of the Study
Significance of the Study
Research Questions
Definition of Terms
Summary and Organization of Study

## Chapter 2: Review of the Literature

Introduction
Background: Law Enforcement Training
Decision-Making Literature
Historical Summary on Judgment/Decision-Making Theory (JDM)
Focus: Naturalistic Decision-Making
Related Concepts
Framework for this Study

## Chapter 3: Methods

Methodology
Population and Sample
Description of Cases
Participant Anonymity
Theoretical Sensitivity
Chapter 4: Case Studies Findings

Background 88
Analysis 92
Causal Conditions of Phenomena Related to Tactical Police Decision-Making - Development of Decision-Making Strategies (First Causal Condition) 93
Second Causal Condition 103
Phenomena Emerging from an Unanticipated Event Caused by Others 106
Context that Influenced Decision-Making Strategies 111
Intervening Conditions that Influenced Strategy Development 114
Strategies for Effective Police Decision-Making 122
Consequences of Strategies for Police Decision-Making Decisions 133
Summary 135

Chapter 5: Conclusions and Recommendations 137

Preparation 140
Preparation - Before going into the field 141
Preparation - While in the field 143
Experience 147
Review of Research Questions 150
Summary and Implications 152
## List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 1</td>
<td>Strategies for Coping with Uncertainty</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2</td>
<td>Differences Between Naturalistic vs. Traditional Decision-Making Research</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3</td>
<td>Criteria for Judging Quantitative and Qualitative Inquiry</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure 1</th>
<th>Recognition-Primed Decision Model</th>
<th>44</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2</td>
<td>Theoretical Model for Effective Tactical Police Decision-Making</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3</td>
<td>Effective Police Decision-Making Strategies</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>