The Model for the Evolution of Retail Institution Types in South Korea

by

Sook-Hyun Kim

Dissertation submitted to the Faculty of the
Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
IN
CLOTHING AND TEXTILES

Doris H. Kincade, Chairman
LuAnn R. Gaskill
Janet E. Keith
Noreen M. Klein
Kusum Singh

July, 2003
Department of Apparel, Housing and Resource Management
Clothing & Textiles Program
Virginia Tech
Blacksburg, VA

Keywords: Retail Evolution, South Korea, Department Stores, Discount Stores,
New Retail Institution, Cyclical Theory, Environmental Theory, Conflict Theory

Copyright 2003, Sook-Hyun Kim
A new retail institution type has emerged in South Korea that is unique in comparison to any previous retail institution type. The study of this emergence and its growth has implications for the future structure of retail both in South Korea and in other parts of the world. To proceed with a study of this new retail institution type, appropriate theory base and research findings about past retailing in South Korea were needed; however, a search of literature indicated that South Korean retailing has been the subject of limited and mostly fragmented research. Historically, many researchers have endeavored to study retail evolution in Western countries. Although extensively studied, used in conceptual work, and applied as foundation in empirical work, some limitations exist with previous retail evolution theories: inability to cover all types of retail institutions, lack of geographic universality, and limited quantification. In conjunction with these limitations, the historic evolution and current structures of retail institution types in South Korea, on the surface, appear to be very different from the evolution and structure of retailing in the Western hemisphere. Several reasons for this difference appear to involve the unique features of South Korea and its culture: retailing types were imported to South Korea within a very compressed time period, unique geography includes small land size and high population concentration in South Korea, the government control and the political insulation of South Korea are different from Western cultures.

The purpose of this study was to examine the evolution of retail institution types in South Korea with a proposed model. To examine the evolution of retail institution types in South Korea and to develop a more universal research model to explain this evolution, a qualitative research design was used. Specifically, a modified grounded theory type of design, with a historical/ comparative analysis method, was used in this study. First, the grounded theory process was used to develop a graphical representation or model using information from
previous research. Second, the researcher collected publicly available data in South Korea from government offices, trade and industry associations, public libraries, and websites on the Internet. Through comparative analysis, data from the South Korean retail industry were examined and compared to the working model.

According to the data analysis, the CREM was partially supported. Regarding the spiral evolution, all types of indicators (e.g., sales, profit, market share, operating cost) did not continuously increase as retail institutions mature, which was in contrast to the CREM, but fluctuated whenever environmental influences interrupted the growth. Four spiral endings were found: (1) upgrade, (2) stay and eventually go out of business, (3) downgrade, and (4) change types of retail institution. In the conflict part, a new retail institution type started competing with its own type, other traditional retail institution types, and a new retail institution type; therefore, the conflict portion in the CREM was also supported. Environmental influences affected not only the emergence of a new retail institution type but also the conflict among retail institution types and the evolution process. In addition, a new reciprocal relationship was found between environmental influences and a new retail institution type and between consumer preference of store/product attributes and a new retail institution type. The environmental influence part was therefore partially supported. The consumer influence variables in the CREM were also supported.

For future research, the final CREM could be the base of research in many types of retail institution and in any countries that have unique retail environments. Using the CREM from this study of retail evolution in South Korea, current and future retail institutions could predict both consumers’ changes depending on environmental influences and what competitive advantages they must achieve to provide benefits to these consumers. In addition, researchers, both academic and retail, could use the final CREM to study the emergence and characteristics of a new retail institution type by analyzing current retail institution types.
ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The author wishes to acknowledge the enthusiastic guidance and advice, patience and generosity of her advisor, Dr. Doris H. Kincade. Without her support, encouragement, and expertise, the development of this research would not have been possible. The author expresses her sincere appreciation to Dr. Kincade, who took care of the author in any cases, in any time, and in any places. The author’s appreciation is extended to the dissertation committee, Drs. LuAnn R. Gaskill, Janet E. Keith, Noreen M. Klein, and Kusum Singh, for their understanding, generosity, persistence and suggestions. The author would like to thank her friends from church and school for their support and friendship. A very special thank is expressed toward her parents, Min-Ung Kim and Hyung-Shim Lee, and other family members, Ji-Hyun Kim, Dong-Hyun Kim, and Jin-Ho Park, for their unconditional love, support and encouragement. Finally, but certainly not least, the author would like to express her deepest gratitude to her husband, Tae-Young Na, for his understanding, generosity, faith, encouragement and infinite love at various stages in the research process.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## CHAPTER I. INTRODUCTION

- Statement of the Problem ................................................................. 1
- Research Questions ................................................................. 3

## CHAPTER II. REVIEW OF LITERATURE ........................................ 4

- Retail Institution Types ................................................................. 4
  - Department Stores ................................................................. 5
  - Discount Stores ................................................................. 6
  - Specialty Stores ................................................................. 7
- Retail Evolution Theories ................................................................. 8
  - Cyclical Theory ................................................................. 8
    - Wheel of Retailing Theory ................................................................. 9
    - Measurement ........................................................................ 12
    - Examples using retail institution types .......................................... 13
    - Limitations ........................................................................ 14
  - Retail Accordion Theory ................................................................. 15
    - Measurements ........................................................................ 15
    - Examples using retail institution types .......................................... 16
    - Limitations ........................................................................ 16
  - Conflict Theory ................................................................. 18
    - Measurements ........................................................................ 19
    - Examples Using Retail Institution Types .......................................... 20
    - Limitations ........................................................................ 21
  - Environmental Theory ................................................................. 22
    - Measurements ........................................................................ 23
    - Examples Using Retail Institution Types .......................................... 25
    - Limitations ........................................................................ 28
  - Combination of Theories ................................................................. 29
    - Combination of Cyclical and Environmental Theories ..................... 29
    - Combination of Cyclical and Conflict Theories ................................... 30
    - Combination of Environmental and Conflict theories ..................... 31
    - Combination of Environmental, Cyclical and Conflict Theories ........... 32
      - Measurement ........................................................................ 34
      - Examples using retail institution types .......................................... 34
      - Limitations ........................................................................ 35
  - Common Limitations of All Retail Evolution Theories ..................... 36

## CHAPTER III. RESEARCH METHOD ............................................. 37

- Research Design ........................................................................ 37
- Trustworthiness and Reliability of Research Design ..................... 38
- Trustworthiness and Reliability of Data ..................................... 39
- Limitations ........................................................................ 40
- Data Collection ........................................................................ 41
- Data Analysis ........................................................................ 42
CHAPTER IV. CONCEPTUAL MODELS ---------------------------------------- 46
  Combined Retail Evolution Model --------------------------------------- 46
  Patterns of Spiral Change and Conflict ------------------------------- 48
  Environmental and Consumer Influences ------------------------------- 50

CHAPTER V. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION ------------------------------------- 53
  Evolution of Retail Institution Types in South Korea ------------------ 53
    Department Stores in South Korea ----------------------------------- 54
      Background ------------------------------------------------------ 54
    Cyclical Evolution of Department Stores ----------------------------- 55
    Environmental Influences on Department Stores ---------------------- 71
      Social environment --------------------------------------------- 71
      Technological environment ------------------------------------- 72
      Economic environment ------------------------------------------ 76
      Political/legal environment ------------------------------------ 80
      Other influences ----------------------------------------------- 82
    Consumer Influences on Department Stores --------------------------- 82
    Overview of the Spiral Evolution of Department Stores ------------- 85
  Discount Stores in South Korea --------------------------------------- 87
    Background ------------------------------------------------------ 87
    Cyclical Evolution of Discount Stores ------------------------------- 88
    Environmental Influences on Discount Stores ------------------------ 102
      Social environment --------------------------------------------- 102
      Technological environment ------------------------------------- 102
      Economic environment ------------------------------------------ 104
      Political/legal environment ------------------------------------ 105
    Consumer Influences on Discount Stores ----------------------------- 106
    Overview of the Spiral Evolution of Discount Stores ------------- 109
  Conflict between Department Stores and Discount Stores -------------- 110
  Emergence of a New Retail Institution Private-Branded Hive Type of
    Retail Institution (the PBH) ---------------------------------------- 113
    Background ------------------------------------------------------ 114
    Cyclical Evolution of the PBH -------------------------------------- 115
      Uniqueness of production process and QR in the PBH --------------) 117
    Environmental influences on the PBH ------------------------------- 120
      Social and economic environments ------------------------------- 120
      Geographic environment ---------------------------------------- 121
      Political/legal environment ------------------------------------ 122
    Consumer Influences on the PBH ------------------------------------ 122
    Overview of Conflict and Evolution of the PBH -------------------- 124

CHAPTER VI. MODEL REFINEMENT, SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS,
  IMPLICATION, AND RECOMMENDATIONS ----------------------------------- 127
  Model Refinement ---------------------------------------------------- 128
  Retail Evolution ----------------------------------------------------- 128
  Phases of the Retail Evolution -------------------------------------- 130
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 2.1</td>
<td>Lifecycle of Retail Institutions</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2.2</td>
<td>Environmental Variables</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.1</td>
<td>Number of Department Stores in South Korea</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.2</td>
<td>Sales Per Store</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.3</td>
<td>Growth Rate of Sales Per Store</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.4</td>
<td>Profit Rate</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.5</td>
<td>Management Focus</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.6</td>
<td>Growth Rate of Operating Expense</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.7</td>
<td>Car Registration for Home use</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.8</td>
<td>GNI Per Capita</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.9</td>
<td>Salary in Wholesale/Retail/Restaurant/Accommodation Industry</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.10</td>
<td>Household Income</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.11</td>
<td>Unemployment Rate</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.12</td>
<td>Sales Per Store, Growth Rate of Sales Per Store, and Number of Discount Stores</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.13</td>
<td>Profit and Growth Rate of Profit</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.14</td>
<td>Number of POS Terminals, Size, and Number of Employees Per Store</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.15</td>
<td>Operating Costs</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.16</td>
<td>Labor and Promotion Costs</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.17</td>
<td>Hourly Payment</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.18</td>
<td>Comparison of Characteristics between Department Stores and Discount Stores</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1. Modified Wheel of Retailing theory ------------------------------------------- 12
Figure 4.1. Combined Retail Evolution Model --------------------------------------------- 47
Figure 5.1. Number of Department Stores in South Korea -------------------------------- 57
Figure 5.2. Sales Per Store ------------------------------------------------------------- 59
Figure 5.3. Growth Rate of Sales Per Store ----------------------------------------------- 62
Figure 5.4. Profit Rate ------------------------------------------------------------------- 63
Figure 5.5. Number of POS Terminals per Store -------------------------------------------- 65
Figure 5.6. Size of Department Store ----------------------------------------------------- 66
Figure 5.7. Growth Rate of Operating Expense --------------------------------------------- 67
Figure 5.8. Wage Per Hour ------------------------------------------------------------------ 69
Figure 5.9. Labor and Promotion Cost ------------------------------------------------------ 69
Figure 5.10. Population Movement into Cities --------------------------------------------- 72
Figure 5.11. Car Registration for Home Use ----------------------------------------------- 74
Figure 5.12. Home Phone Registration ----------------------------------------------------- 75
Figure 5.13. Cellular Phone Registration -------------------------------------------------- 75
Figure 5.14. GNI Per Capita --------------------------------------------------------------- 77
Figure 5.15. Salary in Wholesale/Retail/Restaurant/Accommodation Industry with and with CPI 78
Figure 5.16. Household Income without and with CPI ---------------------------------------- 79
Figure 5.17. Unemployment Rate ----------------------------------------------------------- 81
Figure 5.18. Sales Per Store without CPI and Sales Per Store Based on CPI ------------ 90
Figure 5.19. Growth Rate of Sales Per Store ----------------------------------------------- 90
Figure 5.20. Number of Discount Stores -------------------------------------------------- 91
Figure 5.21. Profit Rate ------------------------------------------------------------------- 93
Figure 5.22. Growth Rate of Profit --------------------------------------------------------- 94
Figure 5.23. Number of POS Terminals Per Store ------------------------------------------- 95
Figure 5.24. Size of Discount Store ------------------------------------------------------- 95
Figure 5.25. Number of Employees Per Store ----------------------------------------------- 96
Figure 5.26. Operating Costs without and with CPI ---------------------------------------- 97
Figure 5.27. Labor Cost -------------------------------------------------------------------- 99
Figure 5.28. Payment Per Hour without and with CPI -------------------------------------- 100
Figure 5.29. Promotion Cost -------------------------------------------------------------- 101
Figure 5.30. Comparison of Household Income and Sales Per Store -------------------------- 105
Figure 6.1. Revised Combined Retail Evolution Model -------------------------------------- 129
Figure 6.2. Final Combined Retail Evolution Model ---------------------------------------- 141