It Seemed Like a Good Idea at the Time:
The Forces Affecting Implementation of Strategies for an Information Technology Project
In the Department of Defense

Ian A. Birdsall

Dissertation submitted to the Faculty of the Center for Public Administration and Policy
Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University
In partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

In

Public Administration

John Dickey, Chair
Kenneth Baile
Larkin Dudley
Gary WAMSley
James Wolf

August 13, 2004
Blacksburg, Virginia

Key Words: Public Strategy, Implementation, Force Field
Public strategy is a widely discussed concept, which especially in an election year is often proposed as a means to improving administrative operations. Over the last 40 years, there has been an explosion in the number of books written about strategy. The academic community and the public have been bombarded with countless theories, models, frameworks, approaches and schools about strategy. We have seen the rise and fall of strategic planning and the movement from strategic management to strategic leadership to strategic thinking. Despite the plethora of solutions, some to problems yet to be discovered, both the private and public sectors continue to see strategies fail. How can it be that strategies still fail when we have so many people available who know how to make them succeed? This study uses an information technology project in the Department of Defense as a field study to determine why the strategies for that project succeeded or why they failed. The research draws on concepts from the Delphi Technique, Force Field Theory, classic strategy literature and public administration to identify and map various levels of forces extant in the implementation environment for those strategies.
Dedication

To my father – I wish you could be here with me today.

And

To my Mother and Dixie, for their unwavering support and extraordinary patience.
Acknowledgements

My heartfelt thanks go out to many people who have contributed in so many ways to this project. Thanks first to my committee and particularly my chair, John Dickey, who always had the time for lunch at Souvlaki’s where we would discuss all things strategic. I would ramble with several semi-coherent thoughts and John was always able to put those thoughts into a logical structure. I always left him feeling smarter than when I arrived. Thanks also go to the entire faculty at the Center for Public Administration and Policy for providing an absolutely outstanding environment for self improvement and intellectual reflection. I feel extremely fortunate to have been associated with such an exceptional program. I would also like to thank my fellow students for their support and friendship. CPAP is a special place and I am indeed fortunate to have been able to study here. Of course, I am extremely indebted to the many friends who worked on JTAV and who took their valuable time to grant me interviews either in person or on the phone. They have truly made this dissertation possible through the generous giving of their time and expertise. I would also like to thank all the people who I have worked with during my career in the Air Force as well as my time at Computer Sciences Corporation and The Logistics Management Institute. You all have contributed to my education. Finally, I must thank my family for their incredible support and patience. You have all helped make me a better person; I thank you all from the bottom of my heart.
# Table of Contents

## CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION
- INTRODUCTION .......................................................... 1
- STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM .................................. 2
- PURPOSE OF THE STUDY ........................................... 3
- CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK ........................................ 3
- THE RESEARCH QUESTION ........................................ 4
- CONCEPT OF FORCES ............................................... 5
- JOINT TOTAL ASSET VISIBILITY .................................. 8
- DELIMITATIONS AND LIMITATIONS ............................... 9
- THE USE OF THEORY ............................................... 11
- SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY ................................... 12

## CHAPTER 2 HISTORY, PHILOSOPHY AND FOUNDATIONS OF STRATEGY .... 13
- INTRODUCTION .......................................................... 13
- ORIGINS OF STRATEGY .............................................. 13
- DEFINITIONS OF STRATEGY ........................................ 14
- DISTINCTIONS .......................................................... 16
  - Implementation/Formulation ..................................... 16
  - Planning, Managing and Thinking ................................. 18
  - Strategy versus Tactics and Policy .............................. 21
- STRATEGY THEORY .................................................... 25
  - Competitive Advantage ........................................... 26
  - Force Field Theory ................................................ 27
  - Organization and Bureaucracy .................................... 28
  - Modernism/Rational/Economic ................................... 28
  - Constructivism versus Realism .................................. 29
  - Systems Theory ..................................................... 30
  - Institutional Theory .............................................. 30
  - Postmodern Theory ............................................... 31
  - New Sciences Theory ............................................. 32
  - Game Theory ....................................................... 34
- PUBLIC /PRIVATE DEBATE ........................................... 35

## CHAPTER 3 STRATEGIES OF THE PUBLIC AND PRIVATE TYPES .......... 38
- INTRODUCTION .......................................................... 38
- MILITARY STRATEGY ................................................ 38
  - Early Military Strategy ........................................... 38
  - Advances in Military Strategic Theory .......................... 42
  - Current Military Strategic Theory ............................... 43
- PRIVATE SECTOR ...................................................... 44
  - Historical Development .......................................... 45
  - Recent Literature in Private Sector Strategy .................. 46
PORTER’S COMPETITIVE STRATEGY…………………………………………………………..46
Resource Based View of the Firm…………………………………………………………49
Other Perspectives on Private Sector Strategy ………………………………………..50

PUBLIC SECTOR……………………………………………………………………………54
Strategy versus Democracy……………………………………………………………54
Bryson’s Strategic Change Cycle ………………………………………………………55
Nutt and Backoff……………………………………………………………………………..56
McMillan Matrix……………………………………………………………………………..57
Why Public Organizations Adopt Strategies………………………………………..59
Competition in the Public Sector……………………………………………………….60
Information Systems and Strategy in the Public Sector……………………………..61

JOINT TOTAL ASSET VISIBILITY……………………………………………………....67

CHAPTER 4 PROCEDE……………………………………………………………………..69
INTRODUCTION……………………………………………………………………………..69
RATIONALE FOR QUALITATIVE METHODOLOGY………………………………69
SPECIFIC TYPE OF QUALITATIVE DESIGN USED……………………………………..72
ANALYTIC MODEL…………………………………………………………………………73
TEXTANALYST2……………………………………………………………………………….75
QUANTITATIVE CYBERQUEST……………………………………………………………76
THE EMERGENCE OF THEORY…………………………………………………………..77
ROLE OF THE RESEARCHER……………………………………………………………..77
DATA COLLECTION PROCEDURES……………………………………………………..78
DATA RECORDING PROCEDURES……………………………………………………...79
DATA ANALYSIS PROCEDURES…………………………………………………………80

CHAPTER 5 DATA ANALYSIS……………………………………………………………85
INTRODUCTION……………………………………………………………………………..85
DATA COLLECTION…………………………………………………………………………85
DATA RECORDING……………………………………………………………………………88
DATA ANALYSIS……………………………………………………………………………89
Developing Initial Data Codes…………………………………………………………….91
Manual Analysis of Interviews…………………………………………………………….94
Combining the Initial List of Forces with the Data Protocol…………………………95
Driving Forces………………………………………………………………………………95
Restrainging Forces…………………………………………………………………………97
Independent or Concerted Forces…………………………………………………………99
Factors That Brought the Forces Together…………………………………………100
Common Theme…………………………………………………………………………..101
Causes of the Forces…………………………………………………………………………102
Effects of the Forces…………………………………………………………………………103
Strategy Effect on Forces…………………………………………………………………..104
Factors Affecting Windows of Opportunity…………………………………………104
Summary of Analysis Phase………………………………………………………………105
List of Figures

Figure 1-1. Force Field Theory.................................................................7
Figure 2-1. The Game Theory Value Net..................................................34
Figure 3-1. Fabyanic Framework of Strategy Analysis...............................43
Figure 3-2. Porter’s Five Forces...............................................................47
Figure 3-3. The Components of Competitive Analysis...............................48
Figure 3-4. Hambrick and Fredrickson Framework..................................52
Figure 3-5. Balanced Scorecard..............................................................53
Figure 4-1. Inductive Mode of Research (Theory)...................................70
Figure 4-2. Inductive Mode of Research (Actual).....................................71
Figure 4-3. High Level Analytic Model....................................................74
Figure 4-4. Notional Semantic Network...................................................76
Figure 4-5. Four Levels of Forces............................................................83
Figure 4-6. Inductive Mode of Research Applied to This Study..................84
Figure 5-1. Hierarchy of Forces...............................................................114
Figure 5-2. Generic Force Field Framework............................................128
Figure 5-3. Level 1 Driving and Restraining Forces in the JTAV Environment...129
Figure 7-1. Level 1 Driving and Restraining Forces in the JTAV Environment...138
Figure 7-2. Effect of Forces on the Status Quo.........................................139
List of Tables

Table 2-1. The Strategic Genealogy ................................................................. 24
Table 3-1. The MacMillan Matrix ................................................................. 58
Table 5-1. Research Questions Related to Essential Elements of Information and Codes ................................................................. 89
Table 5-2. TextAnalyst2 results of interviews with Codes ........................................ 92
Table 5-3. Additional Forces Identified By Manual Review of Interviews ................ 95
Table 5-4. List of Driving Forces Identified from the Manual Review of Interviews .... 97
Table 5-5. Restraining Forces Identified from the Manual Review of Interviews ...... 99
Table 5-6. Independent or Concerted Forces .................................................. 100
Table 5-7. Factors Bringing the Forces Together ............................................. 101
Table 5-8. Common Theme of the Forces ...................................................... 102
Table 5-9. Causes of the Forces ................................................................. 102
Table 5-10. Effects of the Forces ............................................................... 103
Table 5-11. Strategies Effect of Forces ....................................................... 104
Table 5-12. Factors that Affect Windows of Opportunity ............................... 105
Table 5-13. Average Likert Scale Rating of Driving Forces ............................. 109
Table 5-14. Average Likert Scale Rating of Restraining Forces ....................... 111
Table 5-15. Overarching Driving Forces .................................................. 112
Table 5-16. Overarching Restraining Forces .............................................. 112
Table 5-17. Level 3 Driving Forces ............................................................ 117
Table 5-18. Level 3 Restraining Forces ..................................................... 118
Table 5-19. Level 2 Driving Forces ............................................................ 119
Table 5-20. Level 2 Restraining Forces ..................................................... 120
Table 5-21. Level 1 Categories of Forces .................................................... 122
Table 5-22. Level 2 Forces that Map to Level 1 ............................................ 123
Table 5-23. Strength of Level 1 Categories of Forces ..................................... 126
Table 5-24. Relative Strength of Each Characteristic Force ............................ 126
Table 6-1. Mapping of Dr. Dickey’s Factors Affecting Implementation of Information Technology Projects to the Results of this Study ..................................... 131
Coup D’oeil (Koo Dwee)

Literally, a strike in the eye; a glance or look (von Ghyczy, von Oetinger, and Bassford, 2001, 53).

Frederick the Great used the term to describe the ability to grasp the salient features and potential advantages of the terrain at a quick glance (Luvaas, 1966, 142).

Intellectual vision; the rapid recognition of a truth that is utterly invisible to the ordinary view of the mind, or becomes visible only through protracted thought and recognition (Howard and Paret, 1989, 102).