ETHICAL ISSUES IN BUSINESS COMMUNICATION: A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF THE PERCEPTIONS OF JAPANESE AND US STUDENTS

by

Kendra Stahle Boggess

Dissertation submitted to the Faculty of the Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

in

Vocational and Technical Education

B. June Schmidt, Chair
Susan B. Asselin
Curtis R. Finch
Martin C. Schnitzer
Daisy L. Stewart

October 13, 1997
Blacksburg, Virginia

Key Words: Cultural Typology Models, Cultural Beliefs, Cultural Behaviors, Business Ethics, Vignettes
Ethical Issues in Business Communication:  
A Comparative Study of the Perceptions of Japanese and US Students

Kendra Stahle Boggess

(ABSTRACT)

This study compared Japanese and US students' intended beliefs and behaviors relating to ethical business decisions. The study assessed the extent to which three of Hofstede's (1984) cultural indexes related to three ethical classifications of Vitell, Nwachukwu, and Barnes (1993). Participants were 79 US and 33 Japanese students attending West Virginia colleges and universities, representing a response rate of 30.7%.

A set of six vignettes were written to portray subtly unethical business situations. The vignettes were reviewed by two expert panels, and pilot tested on students similar to those participating in the study. Quantitative techniques were used to analyze survey results. Some moderate correlations were found when determining the nature and degree of relationships among Belief and Behavior scores. A chi square analysis was used to determine significant differences between US and Japanese students' demographic characteristics. Means and standards deviations revealed higher scores for Japanese students on all measures for Belief and Behavior questions. These scores indicated that they believed each vignette portrayed a more ethical situation, and that they would more likely engage in such behavior than would US students. ANOVAs were used to examine differences between Japanese and US students' responses to the vignettes, revealing significant differences between groups, but not as Hofstede's dimensions predicted.
Findings on Hofstede's (1984) Individualism versus Collectivism dimension indicate that the theory that members of Japanese cultures will be more willing to work for organizational than personal gain, may not be true, particularly for students. Hofstede's Uncertainty Avoidance dimension, suggesting that members of the Japanese culture will be less comfortable with uncertainty than will members of the US culture, was not supported either. Finally, Hofstede's Masculinity/Femininity dimension, theorizing that members of the Japanese culture are more comfortable with traditional masculine values, was supported.

The major finding of this study is that present-day students did not react to Hofstede's assumptions as expected. Use of different subject groups than Hofstede's and the span of thirty years between his study and this one may have impacted the outcomes. Educators and members of the business community involved with training may find the results of this study helpful. The findings encourage educators and trainers to avoid stereotyping learners' abilities based upon culture or the specifications of cultural typology models.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

There are many people I wish to thank for helping to make this study a reality. First, I thank the members of my research committee for their guidance and support: Dr. B. June Schmidt, Dr. Susan Asselin, Dr. Curtis Finch, Dr. Martin Schnitzer, and Dr. Daisy Stewart.

Dr. B. June Schmidt, my advisor, enabled me to complete this study. My thanks and profound respect for the lifetime of work she has offered to students in her positive and cheerful way. Each time I left Dr. Schmidt's office, it was with a sense of being enabled to go forward, and it was always with a smile. I feel fortunate to have been able to study and work with her. She has modeled the attitude I hope to offer students when they come to me for help in my teaching, advising, and counseling roles.

Dr. Susan Asselin was instrumental in developing my interest in the subject chosen for this study. Her classes in multicultural learning piqued my interest in differences and similarities among cultures in this country. She taught with a zest that renewed my earlier interests in this topic and I will always regard her as an important person in shaping my educational interests.

Dr. Curtis Finch frequently offered guidance and support in the preparation of this document. His confidence in the abilities of students, along with his interest in education, earns him the respect of each student with whom I have studied at VPI. I felt that I would always be able to call upon him for help and guidance and will long remember his curiosity and excitement about learning.

Dr. Martin Schnitzer guided my study in international business topics. It was in his class that I first learned of the work of Geerte Hofstede, upon whose theories this research is based. That foundation led me to an interest in learning as much as possible about the effect of culture on ethics. His willingness to help in my studies and his friendship have meant a great deal to me during my years in graduate school.
Dr. Daisy Stewart has been an inspiration to me and has shown me support in many ways. At times, when she became aware of struggles I was facing, I would receive a letter offering help in one form or another. In her classes, I became more aware of the need for excellent writing skills and also learned a great deal about editing and proofreading, while focusing on course content. Classes that I teach are forever touched by her example.

Beyond those mentors, I would like to thank colleagues who were supportive at my place of employment. They helped and encouraged me when illness leveled both my physical and emotional well-being. Dr. Muhammad Islam, as a friend and mentor, always saw in me the ability to earn the Ph.D., even before I considered it a possibility. Throughout the years, he encouraged, cajoled, and supported me. I will always be grateful for his interest and direction. There are many others at Concord College to whom I owe endless thanks including my colleagues, Susan Robinett, Bill Deck, and Rick Crandall; Bonnie Brown, Administrative Secretary, Sr.; Ray Mull, Registrar; and James Huffman, Associate Director of Admissions. I also appreciate Concord College's financial support.

The most appreciation goes to members of my family. My mother, Vlasta Votroubek Stahle, insisted that I attend college, as she always hoped her daughter would be a teacher. I suspect she would have been the better teacher, but without her encouragement, I would never have begun the journey. In this doctoral venture, she has sacrificed often so I could complete my studies. She has been kind, understanding, and giving in seeing my work grow and she has been a role model in her courageous view of life. She and my father always told me that through effort and hard work, one could achieve every goal, and they inspired me to take many steps I would not have taken on my own.
For my husband, I have nothing but thanks for the patience, the support, the understanding, and the faith he showed in my journey to complete my studies. For this, I will never be able to thank him enough. His time so generously shared, his emotional support, and the willingness he showed in doing whatever it took to see me complete this degree, inspired me to continue. He has been my inspiration, my right hand, and my very generous partner. I feel fortunate to share Ted's love of education and thank him for making it possible for me to complete this degree.
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT ........................................................................................................................................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGMENTS ..........................................................................................................................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONTENTS .......................................................................................................................................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF TABLES ..............................................................................................................................................................</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................................................................................ 1
Communications in Today’s Multicultural Business Environment ................................................................. 4
AACSB Requirements ......................................................................................................................................................... 7
Conceptual Framework ....................................................................................................................................................... 9
Purpose of the Study ........................................................................................................................................................... 14
Research Questions ............................................................................................................................................................ 15
Propositions ..................................................................................................................................................................... 15
  - Individualism versus Collectivism Dimension ........................................................................................................ 16
  - Uncertainty Avoidance Dimension ........................................................................................................................ 17
  - Masculinity/Femininity Dimension .......................................................................................................................... 20
  - Power Distance Dimension ..................................................................................................................................... 20
Significance of Study ......................................................................................................................................................... 21
Operational Definitions ....................................................................................................................................................... 22
Assumptions ....................................................................................................................................................................... 23
Limitations .......................................................................................................................................................................... 24
Threats to Internal Validity ............................................................................................................................................... 25
Organization of the Study ................................................................................................................................................... 26

### CHAPTER 2
REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE ............................................................................................................................................. 28
Changing Demographics ....................................................................................................................................................... 28
Students and Their Ethical Views ....................................................................................................................................... 30
Business and Non-Business Students’ Ethical Attitudes ................................................................................................. 32
Gender and Ethics ............................................................................................................................................................... 36
Family Employment Background .................................................................................................................................. 41
Cross-Cultural Studies of College Students’ Ethical Frameworks .................................................................................. 41
Students’ versus Business Practitioners’ Ethical Standards ............................................................................................... 45
Hofstede’s Dimensions ......................................................................................................................................................... 45
  - Individualism versus Collectivism Dimension ........................................................................................................ 47
  - Uncertainty Avoidance Dimension ........................................................................................................................ 50
  - Masculinity/Femininity Dimension .......................................................................................................................... 54
Power Distance Dimension ................................................................. 57
Summary ............................................................................................... 57

CHAPTER 3
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY ................................................................. 61
Research Design and Questions ............................................................. 61
The Hypotheses ..................................................................................... 64
  Proposition 1, Part a--Individualism versus Collectivism
  Dimension and Professional, Industry, and Organizational
  Codes of Ethics .................................................................................... 64
  Proposition 1, Part b--Individualism versus Collectivism
  Dimension and Self versus Organization as Most Important
  Stakeholder .......................................................................................... 66
  Proposition 2, Part a--Uncertainty Avoidance Dimension
  and Professional, Industry, and Organizational Codes of Ethics ........... 67
  Proposition 2, Part b--Uncertainty Avoidance Dimension and
  Self versus Organization as Most Important Stakeholder ...................... 69
  Proposition 2, Part c--Uncertainty Avoidance Dimension and
  Perceives Ethical Problems .................................................................. 70
  Proposition 3--Masculinity/Femininity Dimension and Perceives
  Ethical Problems .................................................................................. 71
Subject Selection .................................................................................. 72
Obtaining Subjects for the Study ............................................................ 73
Use of Vignettes .................................................................................... 75
Instrument Development ........................................................................ 77
  Scale Development .............................................................................. 78
  Adjusting the Likert Response Scale .................................................... 79
  Vignette Development Review Panel .................................................. 80
  Narrowing the Scope of the Study ....................................................... 81
  Establishing Reliability ........................................................................ 82
Student Pilot Test ................................................................................. 87
Data Collection ..................................................................................... 89
  Contacting Registrars ........................................................................ 89
  Survey Administration ........................................................................ 92
  Follow-up Procedures .......................................................................... 94
  Sequence for Responses ....................................................................... 95
Internal Review Board for Human Subjects Approval ......................... 96
Data Analysis Procedures ..................................................................... 96
Research Question Number 1 ............................................................... 96
Research Question Number 2 ............................................................... 97
Analysis of Variance ............................................................................ 98
Summary ............................................................................................... 98
CHAPTER 4
RESULTS ........................................................................................................... 101
Survey Responses ........................................................................................................ 101
  Demographic Information for Respondents ........................................ 103
  Procedures for Non-Responses ................................................................. 107
  Comparison of Respondents and Non-Respondents’ Answers .......... 110
Analyses for the Research Questions ................................................................. 115
  Preliminary Analysis ............................................................................... 115
    Demographic Variables Related to Vignette Responses ............ 117
    Research Question 1 ....................................................................... 117
    Correlations between Japanese and US Subjects’ Scores .......... 124
    Means and Standard Deviations .................................................. 126
  Primary Analysis--Analyses of Variance, Research Question 2 .... 129
    Individualism versus Collectivism Dimension as related
to Professional, Industry, and Organizational Codes of Ethics ...... 129
    Individualism versus Collectivism Dimension as related
to Self versus Organization as Most Important Stakeholder .......... 136
    Uncertainty Avoidance Dimension as related to
Professional, Industry, and Organizational Codes of Ethics ........ 142
    Uncertainty Avoidance Dimension as related to Self versus
Organization as Most Important Stakeholder ................................ 146
    Uncertainty Avoidance Dimension as related to
Perceives Ethical Problems ............................................................... 148
    Masculinity/Femininity Dimension as related to Perceives
Ethical Problems ............................................................................... 153
Summary ........................................................................................................... 158

CHAPTER 5
SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS ........... 164
Summary ........................................................................................................... 164
  Research Methodology ....................................................................... 166
  Results .................................................................................................... 168
  Discussion .............................................................................................. 170
Conclusions and Recommendations ............................................................ 173
  Individualism versus Collectivism Dimension ................................ 173
  Uncertainty Avoidance Dimension ....................................................... 173
  Masculinity/Femininity Dimension ....................................................... 174
Recommendations for Instruction ................................................................. 175
Recommendations for Further Research ...................................................... 178
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 1</td>
<td>Rankings of US and Japan in Hofstede's Cultural Typology</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2</td>
<td>Individualism versus Collectivism Dimension</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3</td>
<td>Uncertainty Avoidance Dimension</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4</td>
<td>Masculinity/Femininity Dimension</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5</td>
<td>Matrix of Hofstede's Cultural Typology and the Ethical Decision-Making Classifications of Vitell, Nwachukwu, and Barnes (1993)</td>
<td>62-63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6</td>
<td>Reliability Outcomes for Experts Responding to the Vignettes as Japanese and US Students Would (n-10)</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7</td>
<td>Pool of Possible Respondents in the Study</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 8</td>
<td>Analysis of Variance Variables</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 9</td>
<td>Total Surveys Distributed and Total Usable Responses</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 10</td>
<td>General Demographic Information for Respondents (n=112)</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 11</td>
<td>Residential and Family Demographic Information for Respondents (n=112)</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 12</td>
<td>Academic Demographic Information for Respondents (n=112)</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 13</td>
<td>General Demographic Information for Non-Respondents (n=10)</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 14</td>
<td>Residential and Family Demographic Information for Non-Respondents (n=10)</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 15</td>
<td>Academic Demographic Information for Non-Respondents (n=10)</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 16 Comparison of Demographic Response Means between Respondents and Non-Respondents ........................................... 116

Table 17 Correlations on the Belief Questions by Japanese and US Subjects Combined (n=112) ............................................. 119-120

Table 18 Correlations on the Behavior Questions by Japanese and US Subjects Combined (n=112) ............................................. 121-122

Table 19 A Comparison of Japanese and US Respondents' Mean and Standard Deviation scores for Vignette Belief Questions .................................................................................. 127

Table 20 A Comparison of Japanese and US Respondents' Mean and Standard Deviation Scores for Vignette Behavior Questions .................................................................................. 128

Table 21 Summary Table for Analysis of Variance--Belief Question Vignette A, Addressing Individualism versus Collectivism and Professional, Industry and Organizational Codes of Ethics; and Addressing Uncertainty Avoidance and Professional, Industry and Organizational Codes of Ethics .......................................... 132

Table 22 Summary Table for Analysis of Variance--Belief Question Vignette B, Addressing Individualism versus Collectivism and Professional Industry, and Organizational Codes of Ethics; and Addressing Uncertainty Avoidance and Professional, Industry, and Organizational Codes of Ethics..... 133

Table 23 Summary Table for Analysis of Variance--Behavior Question Vignette A, Addressing Individualism versus Collectivism and Professional, Industry, and Organizational Codes of Ethics; and Addressing Uncertainty Avoidance and Professional Industry, and Organizational Codes of Ethics ..... 134

Table 24 Summary Table for Analysis of Variance--Behavior Question Vignette B, Addressing Individualism versus Collectivism and Professional, Industry, and Organizational Codes of Ethics; and Addressing Uncertainty Avoidance and Professional, Industry, and Organizational Codes of Ethics .... 135
Table 25 Summary Table for Analysis of Variance--Belief Question Vignette C, Addressing Individualism versus Collectivism and Self versus Organization as Most Important Stakeholder; and Addressing Uncertainty Avoidance and Self versus Organization as Most Important Stakeholder ............................................................... 138

Table 26 Summary Table for Analysis of Variance--Belief Question Vignette D, Addressing Individualism versus Collectivism and Self versus Organization as Most Important Stakeholder; and Addressing Uncertainty Avoidance and Self versus Organization as Most Important Stakeholder.. 139

Table 27 Summary Table for Analysis of Variance--Behavior Question Vignette D, Addressing Individualism versus Collectivism and Self versus Organization as Most Important Stakeholder; and Addressing Uncertainty Avoidance and Self versus Organization as Most Important Stakeholder ............................................................... 141

Table 28 Summary Table for Analysis of Variance--Behavior Question Vignette D, Addressing Individualism versus Collectivism and Self versus Organization as Most Important Stakeholder; and Addressing Uncertainty Avoidance and Self versus Organization as Most Important Stakeholder............................................................... 142

Table 29 Summary Table for Analysis of Variance--Belief Question Vignette E, Addressing Uncertainty Avoidance and Perceives Ethical Problems; and Addressing Masculinity/Femininity and Perceives Ethical Problems .......... 151

Table 30 Summary Table for Analysis of Variance--Belief Question Vignette F, Addressing Uncertainty Avoidance and Perceives Ethical Problems; and Addressing Masculinity/Femininity and Perceives Ethical Problems .......... 152

Table 31 Summary Table for Analysis of Variance--Behavior Question Vignette E, Addressing Uncertainty Avoidance and Perceives Ethical Problems; and Addressing Masculinity/Femininity and Perceives Ethical Problems .......... 154
Table 32 Summary Table for Analysis of Variance--Behavior Question Vignette F, Addressing Uncertainty Avoidance and Perceives Ethical Problems; and Addressing Masculinity/Femininity and Perceives Ethical Problems .......... 155

Table 33 Summary of Analyses of Variance Outcomes ................. 161-162

Table 34 Summary of Primary Analyses Outcomes .............................. 163

Appendix D
Table D1 Vignette Development ....................................................... 217-218

Appendix F
Table F1 Correlations of Japanese Students' Responses on the Belief Questions ............................................................ 230-231

Table F2 Correlations of US Students' Responses on the Belief Questions ............................................................ 232-233

Table F3 Correlations of Japanese Students' Responses on the Behavior Questions ............................................................ 234-235

Table F4 Correlations of US Students' Responses on the Behavior Questions ............................................................ 236-237