The Interactive Effects of Color Realism, Clustering, and Age on Pictorial Recall Memory among Students in Malaysia

Ahmad Jelani Shaari

Dissertation submitted to the Faculty of the Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy in Curriculum and Instruction

John K. Burton
Lawrence Cross
David M. Moore
Glen Holmes
Kathy Cennamo

April 20, 1998
Blacksburg, Virginia
THE INTERACTIVE EFFECTS OF COLOR REALISM, CLUSTERING, AND AGE ON PICTORIAL RECALL MEMORY AMONG STUDENTS IN MALAYSIA

by
Ahmad Jelani Shaari

Chair: John K. Burton
Department of Teaching and Learning

(ABSTRACT)

This study investigates the effects of clustering or format of presentation (categorized and uncategorized lists), level of color realism of graphics (color pictures, black and white pictures and line drawings), and age (10 year old, 16 year old and adults) on the pictorial recall memory among students in Malaysia. Three hundred sixty students of three age groups were randomly assigned to one of the six stimulus treatments (categorized color, uncategorized color, categorized black and white, uncategorized black and white, categorized line drawing, and uncategorized line drawing). There was a significant interaction effect between age and cluster, $F(2, 342) = 9.07, p < 0.0001)$. Simple main effects test shows that among 10-year olds, significant difference exists between the mean recall of pictures in categorized lists and uncategorized lists. More pictures in the categorized lists were recalled than in the uncategorized ones. However, the mean recall of pictures between the categorized and uncategorized lists among 16-year olds and adults did not differ significantly. Interaction between age and color realism was also significant, $F(4, 342) = 2.93, p < 0.021)$. Simple main effects test indicates that among 10-year olds and adults, the mean number of items recalled differed significantly
under each level of color realism. Pairwise comparison shows that among 10-year olds and adults, color pictures were recalled significantly better than both black and white pictures and line drawings. The mean number of items recalled between black and white pictures and line drawings however, was not significantly different. It was concluded that color pictures or illustrations are recalled better than black and white pictures and line drawings, and that categorized lists of pictures are recalled better than the uncategorized lists.
Acknowledgement

First and foremost, I thank Allah the Most Merciful and the Most Beneficient for His blessing and guidance throughout this important journey in my life.

This journey wouldn't have been successful without help and assistance from many people, who will always be in my heart. With my honor and gratitude, I offer my recognition to all who lend me their assistance and support. I couldn't have accomplished all this without remarkable leadership and guidance from my committee members. From the bottom of my heart, I thank Dr. John Burton, Dr. Lawrence Cross, Dr. Mike Moore, Dr. Glenn Holmes, and Dr. Kathy Cennamo with great respect and admiration for their continuous guidance, expertise, support and insight. A very special thank goes to my committee chairman, Dr. Burton for his ever great support and encouragement. Many thanks also go to Dr Cross for lending his statistical expertise.

I offer my heartfelt thanks to my parents, parents-in-law, brothers, sisters (in-laws), and friends, who although far away, were always close to me in their thoughts and hearts, for their everlasting encouragement, faith, support, and love, and for always being there for me and my family, especially in all the most difficult moments of my life as a student and our life in Blacksburg. This endeavor wouldn't have been accomplished without the unselfish attitude and everlasting encouragement, patience and love from my wife, Salfina. I thank her for all her sacrifice. To my three wonderful daughters: Arina, Aqilah and Anisa, thank you for being my inspiration.

Many thanks are also due to my colleagues and friends at Universiti Utara Malaysia (UUM) for their assistance and kindness. A special thank is due to Associate Prof. Abdul Razak Ismail for all his help. My gratitude also goes to the Ministry of Education for the permission to conduct the experiments in schools. Lastly, I thank all the school children and students at UUM who took part in the experiment, without whom the study wouldn't have been possible.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract  
ii  
Acknowledgement  
iv  
Table of Contents  
v  
Lists of Tables and Figures  
vii  

## Chapter 1  
Introduction 1  
Need for the Study 3  
Purpose of the Study 5  
Review of Literature 6  
Major Theories of Human Information Processing 6  
Visual Realism and Pictorial Recognition 10  
Visual Realism and Pictorial Recall 11  
Recall of Words versus Pictures 12  
Pictorial Recall and Clustering 13  
Recall and Age 16  
Summary 18  
Research Questions 20  
Research Hypotheses 21  

## Chapter 2  
Methodology 22  
Research Design 22  
Participants 22
Lists of Table and Figures

Table 1: Experimental Treatment Groups 23
Table 2: Sequence of 49 items and 7 categories in categorized lists 25
Table 3: Sequence of 49 items in uncategorized lists 26
Table 4: Means and (Standard Deviations) of the number of items recalled associated with the treatment combinations of cluster, color realism and age 30
Table 5: Summary ANOVA Table of Color realism, Cluster and Age 31
Table 6: Means and (Standard Deviations) of the number of items recalled associated with interaction of cluster with age 32
Table 7: Means and (Standard Deviations) of the number of items recalled associated with interaction of color realism with age 33
Figure 1: Plot of cell means of the number of items recalled for cluster by age 34
Figure 2: Plot of cell means of the number of items recalled for color realism by age 34